Fluctuation theorems: where do we go from here?

D. Lacoste

Laboratoire Physico-Chimie Théorique,

UMR Gulliver, ESPCI, Paris



Outline of the talk

- 1. Fluctuation theorems for systems out of equilibrium
- 2. Modified fluctuation-dissipation theorems out of equilibrium
- 3. Fluctuations theorems for systems at equilibrium
- 4. Non-invasive estimation of dissipation

Fluctuation theorems for systems out of equilibrium

What is stochastic thermodynamics?

- 1. <u>Classical Thermodynamics</u>
- First and second law
- Macroscopic systems : fluctuations are gaussian and small
- Absence of time as a parameter



- First and second law at the trajectory level
- Small systems : large non-gaussian fluctuations
- Time enters as an essential parameter







Jarzynski relation

Assume system equilibrated by the contact with a reservoir at temperature T at t=0 Then a control parameter λ_t is applied; final state at time t is not in equilibrium

If system is disconnected from heat bath at t=0 $W_t = H(x_t,\lambda_t) - H(x_0,\lambda_0)$

$$\langle e^{-\beta W_t} \rangle = \int dx_0 p_{eq}(x_0) e^{-\beta W_t}$$

$$= \frac{1}{Z(\lambda_0)} \int dx_t \left| \frac{\partial x_t}{\partial x_0} \right|^{-1} e^{-\beta H(x_t,\lambda_t)} = \frac{Z(\lambda_t)}{Z(\lambda_0)} = e^{-\beta \Delta F}$$

• An exponential average over non-equilibrium trajectories leads to equilibrium behavior

• A method to evaluate free energies from non-equilibrium experiments

C. Jarzynski, PRL 78, 2690 (1997)

« Violations » of the second law of thermodynamics

Using Jensen's inequality $\langle \exp(x) \rangle \ge \exp\langle x \rangle$ one obtains the second law (only valid on average) $\langle W \rangle \ge \Delta F$ Second law can be « violated » for particular realizations, but

$$P(W < \Delta F - \xi) = \int_{\infty}^{\beta(\Delta F - \xi)} dW P(W)$$
$$\leq \int_{\infty}^{\beta(\Delta F - \xi)} P(W) e^{\beta(\Delta F - \xi - W)} \leq e^{-\beta\xi}$$



- Such « violations » are required for the JE to hold but they are exponentially rare.
- « Violations » are pratically unobservable for macroscopic systems

Systems in contact with a thermostat

Interaction with thermostat now described by a markovian evolution

$$\frac{dP_t}{dt} = M_\lambda \cdot P_t$$

Accumulated work up to time t:
$$W_t=\int_0^t \dot\lambda(au) rac{\partial H_\lambda}{\partial\lambda}(x_t)d au$$

Laplace distribution of joint distribution of work and of the fluctuating variable

$$\hat{P}_t(x,\gamma) = \int dW P_t(x,W) e^{-\gamma W}$$

satisfies

$$\frac{\partial \hat{P}_t}{\partial t} = M_\lambda \cdot \hat{P}_t - \gamma \dot{\lambda} \frac{\partial H_\lambda}{\partial \lambda} \hat{P}_t$$

- The solution is $\hat{P}_t(x,\beta) = \langle \delta(x_t x)e^{-\beta W_t} \rangle = \frac{1}{Z_A}e^{-\beta H_\lambda(x)}$
- Jarzynski relation proved by integration over all x: $\langle e^{-\beta W_t}
 angle = e^{-\beta \Delta F}$ ٠
- More generally, for any observable A(x):

$$\langle A(x_t)e^{-\beta W_t}\rangle = A_{eq}(x_t)$$

Hatano-Sasa relation

Generalization when initial condition is in a non-equilibrium steady state (NESS)

Work like functional $Y_t = \int_0^t d\tau \dot{\lambda} \frac{\partial \phi}{\partial \lambda}(x_{\tau}, \lambda_{\tau})$ where $\phi(x, \lambda) = -\ln P_{stat}(x, \lambda)$

• Average over non-equilibrium trajectories leads to steady-state behavior

 $\langle e^{-Y_t}
angle = 1$ T. Hatano and S. Sasa, (2001)

Now $\langle Y_t \rangle \geq 0$ where the equality holds for a quasi-stationary process

Crooks relation

Let us define forward and reverse processes which both start in an equilibrium with fixed value of λ



Forward trajectory $\gamma_F = \{x_F(t), 0 < t < t_f\}$ Reverse trajectory $\gamma_R = \{x_R(t), 0 < t < t_f\}$

with
$$x_R(t) = x_F^*(t_f - t)$$

If the reservoir is removed during the process

$$\frac{P_F(\gamma_F)}{P_R(\gamma_R)} = \frac{P_F(x_F(0))}{P_R(x_R(0))} = \frac{e^{-\beta H(x_F(0),\lambda_i)}}{Z(\lambda_i)} \frac{Z(\lambda_f)}{e^{-\beta H(x_F(t_f),\lambda_f)}} = e^{\beta(W_F - \Delta F)}$$

As a particular case, at equilibrium, fluctuations are symmetric under time-reversal

$$P_{eq}(\gamma_F) = P_{eq}(\gamma_R)$$

Same result holds for systems obeying markovian stochastic dynamics provided

$$\frac{M_{\lambda}(x \to x')}{M_{\lambda}(x' \to x)} = e^{-\beta \left(H(x',\lambda) - H(x,\lambda)\right)}$$

Rk: this detailed balance condtion holds only if the heat bath is ideal

Through integration of trajectories of given value of $W=W_F$

$$\frac{P_F(W)}{P_R(-W)} = e^{\beta(W - \Delta F)}$$

G. Crooks, PRE 61,2361 (1999)

Experiments : using RNA hairpin pulled by optical tweezers



• Introducing KL divergence

$$D(p|q) = \sum_{c} p(c) \ln \frac{p(c)}{q(c)} \ge 0$$

- asymmetric character of the measure is crutial

- From ${P_F(\gamma_F)\over P_R(\gamma_R)}=e^{eta(W_F-\Delta F)}$ by taking the average

$$D(P_F|P_R) = \frac{\langle W \rangle - \Delta F}{k_B T} = \frac{\langle W^{diss} \rangle}{k_B T}$$

- The functional $W_{diss}=W-\Delta F$ leads to the same estimate of dissipation as the KL divergence of path probabilities
- Non-equilibrium fluctuations created by irreversible processes (such as systems presenting hysteresis) are asymmetric with respect to time-reversal

Evans-Searles and Gallavotti-Cohen relation

- 1. <u>Transient fluctuation theorem of Evans-Searles</u>
 - The system is initially at equilibrium and evolves towards a NESS

$$\frac{P_{\tau}(\Delta S)}{P_{\tau}(-\Delta S)} = e^{\Delta S/k_B}$$
 Evans DJ, Searles DJ, (1994)

- NESS can be created from multiple reservoirs or from time-symmetric driving
- Also holds separetely for parts of entropy production under conditions
- 2. Fluctuation theorem of Gallavotti-Cohen
 - The asymptotic distribution of entropy production rate $\,\sigma=\Delta S/ au\,$ in a NESS

$$\lim_{\tau \to \infty} \frac{1}{\tau} \ln \frac{P_{\tau}(\sigma)}{P_{\tau}(-\sigma)} = \frac{\sigma}{k_B T}$$

Gallavotti G., Cohen EGD, (1995)

• Implies relations for distribution of currents in a NESS

Trajectory dependent entropy for a particle or system

- 1. Within Fokker-Planck equation (markovian) $\partial_t p_t(x_t) = -\partial_x j_t(x)$ • Definition : stochastic entropy $s_t = -\ln p_t(x_t)$ Seifert U., (2005)
- 2. <u>Second law of thermodynamics</u>
 - Heat dumped into heat bath assumed ideal according to Sekimoto : q

$$\ln \frac{P_F[x_t|x_0]}{P_R[x_t^R|x_0^R]} = \Delta s_m = \frac{q}{T}$$

Then

 $\Delta s = \ln p_0(x_0) - \ln p_t(x_t)$ difference of Shanon entropy

$$\Delta s_{tot} = \ln \frac{P_F[x_t]}{P_R[x_t^R]} = \Delta s_m + \Delta s$$

which satisfies an integral fluctuation theorem by construction $\langle e^{-\Delta s_{tot}} \rangle = 1$ Rk: condtions for a detailed FT for s_{tot} are more restrictive

Fluctuation theorems for molecular motors

• Discrete ratchet model

Velocity data of kinesin K. Vissher et al., (1999)





- Average ATP consumption rate:
- Strong coupling

 $\bar{r} = 111 s^{-1}$ $\ell = \frac{\bar{v}}{r} \approx 0.97$

A.W.C. Lau et al., PRL 99, 158102 (2007); D. L. et al., PRE 78, 011915 (2008).

Minimal ratchet: thermodynamics

 $\bar{v}(f,\Delta\mu) = \lim_{t \to \infty} \frac{d\langle n(t) \rangle}{dt}$ $\bar{r}(f,\Delta\mu) = \lim_{t \to \infty} \frac{d\langle y(t) \rangle}{dt}$

• Statistics of the displacement n(t) and of the number of ATP molecules consumed y(t) as function of external and chemical loads ?

Velocity (mechanical current)

ATP consumption rate (chemical current)

• At thermodynamic equilibrium: f=0 and $\Delta\mu$ =0, fluctuations of n(t) and y(t) are gaussian, characterized by two diffusion coefficients D₁ and D₂

• Near equilibrium: for small f and $\Delta \mu = 0$, linear response theory holds,

$$v = L_{11}f + L_{12}\Delta\mu$$
 Einstein relations: $L_{11}=D_1$ and $L_{22}=D_2$
 $\bar{r} = L_{21}f + L_{22}\Delta\mu$ Onsager relations: $L_{12}=L_{21}$

• What happens far from equilibrium ?

Large deviations of the currents

• Long time properties of n(t) and y(t) are embodied in the large deviation function G(v,r)

$$\operatorname{Prob}(\frac{n(t)}{t} = v, \frac{y(t)}{t} = r) \simeq e^{-tG(v,r)}$$



800

• Equivalently, one has the cumulant generating function $E(\lambda,\gamma)$

$$\left\langle e^{\lambda n+\gamma y}\right\rangle \simeq e^{tE(\lambda,\gamma)}$$

• In particular

- ar $\bar{v}(f,\Delta\mu) = \frac{\partial E}{\partial\lambda}(0,0)$ and $\bar{r}(f,\Delta\mu) = \frac{\partial E}{\partial\gamma}(0,0)$
- The functions G(v,r) and $E(\lambda,\gamma)$ are related by Legendre transforms

Gallavotti-Cohen relation for a discrete ratchet model

• The function $E(\lambda, \gamma)$ satisfies the Gallavotti-Cohen symmetry :

$$E(\lambda, \gamma) = E(-\lambda - f, -\gamma - \Delta \mu)$$

which implies the Fluctuation theorem in the long time limit:

$$\frac{\operatorname{Prob}(\frac{n(t)}{t} = v, \frac{y(t)}{t} = r)}{\operatorname{Prob}(\frac{n(t)}{t} = -v, \frac{y(t)}{t} = -r)} \approx e^{t(fv + r\Delta\mu)}$$

- Valid arbitrary far from equilibrium Linear expansion near equilibrium leads to Einstein and Onsager relations
- Results from local thermodynamic constraints : Generalized Detailed Balance

Phase diagram and thermodynamic efficiency



- <u>4 regions of mechano-transduction :</u>
- A: ATP in excess -> mechanical work B: mechanical work -> ATP C: ADP in excess -> mechanical work D: mechanical work -> ADP

$$\begin{array}{lll} A: & f \, \overline{v} < 0 & \text{and} & \overline{r} \Delta \mu > 0 \\ B: & f \, \overline{v} > 0 & \text{and} & \overline{r} \Delta \mu < 0 \\ C: & f \, \overline{v} < 0 & \text{and} & \overline{r} \Delta \mu > 0 \\ D: & f \, \overline{v} < 0 & \text{and} & \overline{r} \Delta \mu < 0 \end{array}$$



Thermodynamic efficiency

$$\eta = -\frac{f \,\overline{v}}{\overline{r} \Delta \mu}$$

is maximum far from equilibrium (which is reached on a point in $(\Delta \mu, f)$ plane)

Gallavotti-Cohen relation for a continuous ratchet model



Flashing ratchet model

also obeys the GC symmetry provided both mechanical and chemical variables are included

 $E(f - \lambda, \Delta \mu - \gamma) = E(\lambda, \gamma)$ but in general $e(f - \lambda) \neq e(\lambda)$



D. L. et al., PRE 80, 021923 (2009); Séminaires Poincaré, biological physics (2009)

Modified fluctuation-dissipation theorems out of equilibrium

Standard fluctuation-dissipation theorem (FDT)

Only holds for systems which are close to an equilibrium state

A perturbation : $H_0 - > H_0 - h_{t'}O$ is applied at time t' :

Response function (for t>t')

$$\left| R(t,t') = \frac{\partial \langle A(t) \rangle}{\partial h_{t'}} \right|_{h=0} = \beta \frac{d}{dt'} \langle A(t)O(t') \rangle_{eq}$$

Einstein (1905), Nyquist (1928); H. Callen and T. Welton (1951), Kubo (1966)

Many attempts to extend the result to non-equilibrium systems

From Jarzynski equality to fluctuation-dissipation theorem (FDT)

More general form of Jarzynski equality

٠

٠

$$\left\langle A(x_t)e^{-\beta W_{diss}}\right\rangle = \left\langle A(x_t)\right\rangle_{eq}$$

- If dissipated work $\,W_{diss}\,$ is small with respect to kT

$$\langle A_t(x_t) \rangle_{eq} \simeq \langle A_t(x_t) \rangle + \left\langle A_t(x_t) \int_0^t d\tau' \dot{h}_{\tau'} \partial_h \log p_{eq}(x_{\tau'}, h_{\tau'}) \right\rangle$$

Take functional derivative with respect to perturbation

$$R(t',t) = \left. \frac{\delta \langle A(x_t) \rangle}{\delta h_{t'}} \right|_{h \to 0} = \frac{d}{dt'} \left\langle A_t(x_t) \frac{\partial \log p_{eq}(c_{t'},h_{t'})}{\partial h} \right\rangle_{eq}$$

Modified fluctuation-dissipation theorem (MFDT) near NESS

Variant of Hatano-Sasa (2001) :

$$\left\langle A(x_t)e^{\int_0^\tau dt\dot{h}_t\partial_h\log p_{st}(x_t,h_t)}\right\rangle = \langle A(x_t)\rangle_{st}$$

Response function near a non-equilibrium steady state for a general observable A

$$R(t',t) = \frac{d}{dt'} \left\langle A_t(x_t) \frac{\partial \log p_{st}(c_{t'},h_{t'})}{\partial h} \right\rangle_{st}$$

• Particular case
$$A_{t'}(x_{t'}) = rac{\partial \log p_{st}(c_{t'},h_{t'})}{\partial h}$$
 J. Prost et al. (2009)

U. Seifert et al. (2010) G. Verley, K. Mallick, D. L., EPL, **93**, 10002 (2011)

• General case

•

•

Perturbation near an arbitrary non-stationary state

Most general MFDT obtained from an Hatano-Sasa like relation:

$$R(t',t) = \frac{d}{dt'} \left\langle A_t(x_t) \frac{\partial \log \pi_t(c_{t'}, h_{t'})}{\partial h} \right\rangle$$

G. Verley et al., J. Stat. Mech. (2011)

Several alternate formulations:

٠

.

- In terms of an additive correction (the asymmetry) which vanishes at equilibrium M. Baiesi et al. (2009); E. Lippiello et al. (2005)
- In terms of a local velocity/current R. Chétrite et al. (2008); U. Seifert et al. (2006)

<u>Rk:</u> in all these formulations, markovian dynamics is assumed

Origin of the additive structure of MFDT

• Stochastic trajectory entropy $s_t(c_t, [h]) = -\ln \pi_t(c_t, [h])$

 \circ Distinct but similar to

$$ilde{s}_t(c_t,[h]) = -\ln p_t(c_t,[h])$$
 U. Seifert, (2005)

 \circ It can be split into

Reservoir entropy + Total entropy production

$$\Delta s_t(c_t, [h]) = -\Delta s_r(c_t, [h]) + \Delta s_{tot}(c_t, [h])$$

• Consequence of this decomposition for MFDT:

$$\begin{aligned} R_{eq}(t,t') &= \frac{d}{dt'} \left\langle \partial_h \Delta s_{t'}^r(c_{t'},h) \Big|_{h \to 0} A_t(c_t) \right\rangle & R_{neq}(t,t') &= \frac{d}{dt'} \left\langle \partial_h \Delta s_{t'}^{tot}(c_{t'},h) \Big|_{h \to 0} A_t(c_t) \right\rangle \\ &= \left\langle j_{t'}(c_{t'}) A_t(c_t) \right\rangle &= \left\langle V_{t'}(c_{t'}) A_t(c_t) \right\rangle \end{aligned}$$

• Additive structure of the MFDT involving local currents:

$$R(t,t') = \left\langle (j_{t'}(c_{t'}) - V(c_{t'}))A_t(c_t) \right\rangle$$

The 1D Ising model with Glauber dynamics

• Classical model of coarsening : L Ising spins in 1D described by the hamiltonian

$$H(\{\sigma\}) = -J\sum_{i=1}^{L} \sigma_i \sigma_{i+1} - H_m \sigma_m,$$

• System initially at equilibrium at $T = \infty$ is quenched at time t=0 to a final temperature T.



• At the time t'>0, a magnetic field H_m is turned on:

$$H_m(t) = H_m \theta(t - t'),$$

• The dynamics is controlled by time-dependent (via H_m) Glauber rates

$$w^{H_m}(\{\sigma\},\{\sigma\}^i) = \frac{\alpha}{2} \left(1 - \sigma_i \tanh\left(\beta J\left(\sigma_{i-1} + \sigma_{i+1}\right) + \beta H_m \delta_{im}\right)\right)$$

• Analytical verification :

- MFDT can be verified although the distributions $p_t({s}, H_m)$ even for a zero magnetic field are not analytically calculable

- Analytical form of the response is known

• <u>Numerical verification</u>: the distributions $p_t({s}, H_m)$ can be obtained numerically for a small system size (L=14); and the MFDT verified:

Integrated response function $\chi_{n-m}(t,t') = \int_{-\infty}^{t} d\tau R_{n-m}(t,\tau)$



Fluctuation theorems for equilibrium systems

1. For non-equilibrium systems:

• Extension of Gallavotti-Cohen

$$\lim_{\tau \to \infty} \frac{1}{\tau} \ln \frac{P_{\tau}(\mathbf{J})}{P_{\tau}(\mathbf{J}')} = \epsilon \cdot (\mathbf{J} - \mathbf{J}') \qquad P. \text{ Hurtado et al. (2011)}$$

for any pairs of isometric current vectors $|{f J}|=|{f J}'|$ and $\,\epsilon\,$ is related to entropy production

- 2. For equilibrium systems with discrete broken symmetry
 - For an ensemble of N Ising spins in a magnetic field

 $P_B(M) = P_B(-M)e^{2\beta BM}$ P. Gaspard (2012)

- Equilibrium fluctuations in finite systems are in general non-gaussian
- Non-gaussianity particularly significant near critical points

• Consider N Heisenberg spins in a magnetic field

$$H_N(\sigma;\mathbf{B}) = \mathbf{H}_{\mathbf{N}}(\sigma;\mathbf{0}) - \mathbf{B}\cdot\mathbf{M}_{\mathbf{N}}(\sigma) \quad \text{ with } \quad \mathbf{M}_{\mathbf{N}}(\sigma) = \sum_{\mathbf{i}=\mathbf{1}}\sigma_{\mathbf{i}}$$

N

• Fluctuations of the magnetization M obey the general relation:

$$P_{\mathbf{B}}(\mathbf{M}) = P_{\mathbf{B}'}(\mathbf{M}) e^{\beta(\mathbf{B}-\mathbf{B}')\cdot\mathbf{M}},$$

where $\mathbf{M}' = R_q^{-1} \cdot \mathbf{M}$ thus $|\mathbf{M}| = |\mathbf{M}'|$ (isometric fluctuation theorems)

• This fluctuation theorem expresses a symmetry of the large deviation function defined by

$$P_{\mathbf{B}}(\mathbf{M}) = \mathbf{A}_{\mathbf{N}}(\mathbf{m}) e^{-\mathbf{N} \Phi_{\mathbf{B}}(\mathbf{m})}, \text{ for } \mathbf{N} \to \infty$$

 These fluctuation theorems quantify the breaking of a symmetry different from time reversal

Illustrative examples

• Curie-Weiss model in a magnetic field: exact evaluation of the large deviation function

• XY model in a magnetic field numerical verification at low and high temperatures

• More complex symmetry breaking with tensorial order parameter in a liquid crystal mean-field model



Non-invasive estimation of dissipation from trajectory information

Irreversibility as time-reversal symmetry breaking

- Direct determination of work or heat is difficult for most complex systems
- Non-equilibrium fluctuations created by irreversible processes have a welldefined arrow of time
- This arrow of time can be « measured » by comparing the statistics of fluctuations forward and backward in time using the KL divergence
- This amounts to enforce fluctuation theorems and exploit them to extract a measurement rather than trying to « verify » them

Estimation of dissipation in a NESS

• Mesure of dynamical randomness associated with direct and reverse path where in the reverse path the driving is reversed



• In other types of NESS, the driving if present is constant and does not need to be reversed -> simpler implementation with a single data series

Simpler implementation with no reversal of the driving

• Probability to observe a block of length m, $(x_1..x_m)$ within a trajectory of total length n in the forward direction $p_F = p(x_1..x_m)$

$$D_m(p_F|p_B) = \sum_{x_1..x_m} p(x_1..x_m) \ln \frac{p(x_1..x_m)}{p(x_m..x_1)}$$

• Connection between thermodynamics and information-theoretic estimation

$$\langle \Delta S \rangle \ge d(p_F | p_B) = \lim_{m \to \infty} \frac{1}{m} D_m(p_F | p_B)$$

E. Roldan et al. (2010)

Dissipation in chemical reactions networks



- Equilibrium condition (detailed balance): $k_1k_2k_3=k_{-1}k_{-2}k_{-3}$
- Conservation of the total number of particles: linear dynamics
- Can one detect that the system is out of equilibrium using only information contained in the fluctuations of $\{n_A, n_B\}$ or n_A ?



- Possibility to distinguish equilibrium from non-equilibrium fluctuations in a non-invasive way, even when only partial information is available
- Method works for arbitrary number of non-linear chemical reactions
- The quality of the estimate depends primarily on the resolution, i.e. on the degree of coarse-graining of the input data

S. Muy et al., J. Chem. Phys. (2013)

Estimating dissipation in systems with time-dependent driving



S. Tush et al., PRL, (2014)



Stochastic work and heat on a cycle:

$$W(\tau) = \int_0^\tau dt \ \dot{B}(t) \partial_B U(\mathbf{r}(t), B(t))$$
$$Q(\tau) = \int_0^\tau dt \nabla_\mathbf{r} U(\mathbf{r}(t), B(t)) \circ \dot{\mathbf{r}}.$$



Energy vs. information based estimation of dissipation

For information based estimation:

- a) compare forward/backward probability distributions
- b) compare equilibrium/non-equilibrium probability distributions

4

$$\begin{split} \beta \langle W_{diss}(\tau) \rangle &\geq D(p_{F}(t) || p_{R}(\tau - t)) \\ & \text{R. Kawai et al. (2007)} \\ \beta \langle W_{diss}(t) \rangle &\geq D(p_{neq}(t) || p_{eq}(t)), \\ & \text{S. Vaikuntanathan et al. (2009)} \end{split}$$

Acknowledgements

- 1. Fluctuation theorems for systems out of equilibrium K. Mallick, A. Lau
- 2. Fluctuations theorems for systems at equilibrium P. Gaspard
- 3. Modified fluctuation-dissipation theorems out of equilibrium R. Chétrite, G. Verley
- 4. Non-invasive estimation of dissipation from trajectory information Theory: A. Kundu, G. Verley Experiments with manipulated colloids: S. Tush, J. Baudry